

## Imagine this Scenario

**John Trainor MSW**  
**Toronto, Canada**

Invited Response to JAMA Viewpoint | January 20, 2015 :  
"Improving Long-term Psychiatric Care: Bring Back the  
Asylum".  
JAMA. 2015;313(3):243-244. doi:10.1001/jama.2014.16088.

Imagine this scenario: two social experiments have been tried. One is a proven failure. It has been tried in many ways over many years with many different groups. There are thousands of examples, many well planned, and yet there is an overwhelming verdict: failure. Proponents are frustrated that even the best examples failed, but there is no question that they have. The research shows this, and the experience of the people who lived in the experiment shows it. This experiment was putting people in asylums.

The second experiment is different. It has proven successful for the majority of the people who have tried it. None of these people want to go back to the failed experiment. But it is not working for everyone. Some people are not well served and are suffering. When the second experiment was studied, it was found that serious mistakes were made when setting it up. Many of the people who were most troubled did not get cared for as they needed. But many did, and these people did very well, in fact better than anyone did in the old experiment. So it is known that it works, and that the new experiment is a proven success when it is done properly. The old experiment always failed.

The biggest thing that has been learned is that the people who live in these two experiments need to be listened to if things are to go well. They say "Don't go back to the old experiment; do the new one properly!" The biggest danger is now known. It is not listening.

Despite this, there are still people, often from universities, who can't understand this simple fact: listen. They feel they know better. And so they have a new plan. Don't listen, don't learn. Go back to the proven failure, even as you recognize that the better experiment has not been properly offered to all the people you want to help. Speak of ethics while you propose the massive violation of human rights; speak of care when the evidence shows incarceration.

This is arrogance that is unaware of itself. It is the ignorance that paves the road to hell.

*Acknowledgements: none*

*Competing interests: none*

*Address for correspondence:*  
*john@johntrainor.ca*

*Date of Publication: May 19 2015*